

February 8, 2018

Todd Merchen, PE, PG
City of Gillette
201 E 5th St.
Gillette, WY 82716

RE: PMS 2018 Schedule A
Project No. 18EN02 MMI# 4323.041

Mr. Merchen:

Morrison-Maierle has reviewed the four bids received at 2:30 p.m. on February 7, 2018 for the PMS 2018 Schedule A Project. Of the bids received, all four are recommended for acceptance as responsive bids.

The following Contractors submitted bids, listed alphabetically:

- | | |
|-----------------------------------|--------------|
| • Corland Construction | Sidney, MT |
| • Powder River Construction, Inc. | Gillette, WY |
| • S&S Builders, LLC | Gillette, WY |
| • Van Ewing Construction, Inc. | Gillette, WY |

There were no errors with any of the bids, and Morrison-Maierle considers all four to be responsive bids.

Three of the four contractors submitted a Wyoming Residency Certificate. Corland Construction, out of Sidney, MT, did not. However, the 5% Wyoming Preference Act of 1971, W.S. 16-6-201 did not cause a change in the lowest bidder.

All bids received appeared to meet all requirements. All forms were signed, sealed, used City of Gillette forms, and had bid bonds for the corrected amounts. There were no mathematical errors within the bids.

The following table summarizes the bids received, as well as the Engineer's Estimate.

Bidder	Total Bid
Van Ewing Construction, Inc.	\$ 579,117.34
Powder River Construction, Inc.	\$ 620,281.75
S&S Builders, LLC	\$ 620,913.00
Corland Construction	\$ 863,903.40
Engineer's Estimate	\$ 744,173.55

The low bid received was \$165,056.21 lower than the Engineer's Estimate; this is approximately 22.2%. The high bid was approximately 16.1% higher (\$119,729.85) than the Engineer's Estimate. There is a \$284,786.06 (33.0%) difference between the highest and the lowest bids.

When comparing the lowest bid to the Engineer's Estimate, two (2) bid items accounted for over \$94,000 of the \$165,000 difference. The other portion of the difference arise from items were minor savings over various smaller quantity items. These two (2) bid items were:

- 6.5" Portland Cement Concrete Paving
- 6" Aggregate Base

A historical comparison was completed in the process of developing the Engineer's Estimate and evaluating the bids. Over a decade of project data has been compiled by Morrison-Maierle specifically for the City of Gillette projects. The following table represents the differences in these bid items.

Bid Item	Unit	Min. (\$)	Median (\$)	Avg. (\$)	Max. (\$)	Eng. Est. (\$)	Van Ewing Construction, Inc. (\$)
6.5" Portland Cement Concrete Paving	SY	51.00	58.05	55.61	70.00	55.00	47.65
6" Aggregate Base	SY	3.00	10.00	10.50	13.50	16.00	4.95

The Engineer's Estimate is typically developed in the lower range between the minimum price and the median, with an emphasis on recent bid tabs and projects of similar size. Only two bids in ten years had aggregate base under \$10/SY. While it does happen, an estimate in this range is not statistically viable. The costs received on this job had base in that range. Similarly, while not out of line statistically, there is a cost savings on concrete as well. Due to the large quantities of both present in this job, both results in a large savings when compared to the Engineer's Estimate.

With the range and quantity of bids, it is our opinion that the bids received were highly competitive.

Based on this bid, we recommend awarding the contract for the PMS 2018 Schedule A Project to Van Ewing Construction, Inc., in the amount of \$579,117.34, contingent upon City of Gillette funds.

We have also attached the official bid tabulation. Please review and let us know if you have any questions.

Sincerely,
MORRISON-MAIERLE, INC.



Zane A. Green, P.E.
Project Engineer

Encl (1): Bid Tabulation



PMS 2018 SCHEDULE A
PROJECT 18EN02
BID TABULATION



Item No.	DESCRIPTION	UNITS	BID QTY	VAN EWING CONSTRUCTION, INC. PO BOX 99 GILLETTE, WY 82717		POWDER RIVER CONSTRUCTION, INC. 4001 E COLLINS ROAD GILLETTE, WY 82718		S&S BUILDERS, LLC PO BOX 1867 GILLETTE, WY 82717		CORLAND CONSTRUCTION 2730 MISSION CANYON DR UNIT B SIDNEY, MT 59270		ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE	
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
01020.01	MOBILIZATION	LS	1	\$ 31,084.00	\$ 31,084.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 39,500.00	\$ 39,500.00	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00
01020.02	CONTRACT BONDS	LS	1	\$ 4,488.00	\$ 4,488.00	\$ 5,980.00	\$ 5,980.00	\$ 3,244.00	\$ 3,244.00	\$ 22,000.00	\$ 22,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00
01020.03	FORCE ACCOUNT	LS	1	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00
01500.11	CONSTRUCTION STORMWATER MANAGEMENT	LS	1	\$ 2,200.00	\$ 2,200.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 8,995.00	\$ 8,995.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00
01510.01	CONSTRUCTION SIGNING AND TRAFFIC CONTROL	LS	1	\$ 12,650.00	\$ 12,650.00	\$ 27,500.00	\$ 27,500.00	\$ 6,150.00	\$ 6,150.00	\$ 18,000.00	\$ 18,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00
01510.02	FLAGGING	1/4 HR	1,440	\$ 11.25	\$ 16,200.00	\$ 1.25	\$ 1,800.00	\$ 8.85	\$ 12,744.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 14,400.00	\$ 8.00	\$ 11,520.00
01510.03	PROJECT IDENTIFICATION SIGN	EA	1	\$ 633.00	\$ 633.00	\$ 850.00	\$ 850.00	\$ 1,030.00	\$ 1,030.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00
01510.04	SOLID DOUBLE YELLOW CENTER STRIPE	LF	850	\$ 0.28	\$ 238.00	\$ 0.35	\$ 297.50	\$ 0.30	\$ 255.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 12,750.00	\$ 0.50	\$ 425.00
01510.06	BROKEN WHITE LANE LINE	LF	1,700	\$ 0.11	\$ 187.00	\$ 0.15	\$ 255.00	\$ 0.12	\$ 204.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 8,500.00	\$ 0.10	\$ 170.00
01510.07	SOLID WHITE STACKING LANE STRIPE	LF	70	\$ 0.56	\$ 39.20	\$ 0.75	\$ 52.50	\$ 0.60	\$ 42.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 1,050.00	\$ 0.30	\$ 21.00
01510.12	STOP BARS	LF	24	\$ 2.25	\$ 54.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 48.00	\$ 2.50	\$ 60.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$ 1.20	\$ 28.80
01510.13	TURN ARROW	EA	4	\$ 39.38	\$ 157.52	\$ 35.00	\$ 140.00	\$ 43.00	\$ 172.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 40.00	\$ 160.00
01510.14	PEDESTRIAN CROSSING STRIPES	EA	12	\$ 13.50	\$ 162.00	\$ 12.00	\$ 144.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 180.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 180.00
02050.24	REMOVAL OF EXISTING FENCE	LF	24	\$ 10.00	\$ 240.00	\$ 23.50	\$ 564.00	\$ 16.00	\$ 384.00	\$ 20.80	\$ 499.20	\$ 5.00	\$ 120.00
02075.01	REMOVAL OF EXISTING ASPHALT PAVEMENT	SY	343	\$ 8.66	\$ 2,970.38	\$ 6.50	\$ 2,229.50	\$ 9.50	\$ 3,258.50	\$ 29.00	\$ 9,947.00	\$ 8.00	\$ 2,744.00
02075.02	REMOVAL OF PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE PAVEMENT	SY	4,560	\$ 6.08	\$ 27,724.80	\$ 8.25	\$ 37,620.00	\$ 6.60	\$ 30,096.00	\$ 12.00	\$ 54,720.00	\$ 6.50	\$ 29,840.00
02075.04	REMOVAL OF SIDEWALK	SF	1,911	\$ 1.35	\$ 2,579.85	\$ 2.50	\$ 4,777.50	\$ 1.50	\$ 2,866.50	\$ 4.00	\$ 7,644.00	\$ 1.25	\$ 2,388.75
02075.05	REMOVAL OF DRIVEWAY	SF	696	\$ 1.35	\$ 939.60	\$ 3.00	\$ 2,088.00	\$ 1.50	\$ 1,044.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 2,784.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 1,392.00
02075.06	REMOVE CURB & GUTTER (TANGENT)	LF	773	\$ 4.05	\$ 3,130.65	\$ 7.75	\$ 5,990.75	\$ 4.25	\$ 3,285.25	\$ 10.00	\$ 7,730.00	\$ 7.00	\$ 5,411.00
02075.10	REMOVAL OF CONCRETE FILLET	SF	80	\$ 2.03	\$ 162.40	\$ 3.25	\$ 260.00	\$ 2.20	\$ 176.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 400.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 400.00
02075.11	REMOVAL OF CONCRETE VALLEY GUTTER	SF	1,440	\$ 2.03	\$ 2,923.20	\$ 2.25	\$ 3,240.00	\$ 2.20	\$ 3,168.00	\$ 4.50	\$ 6,480.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 2,880.00
02075.12	REMOVAL OF RETAINING WALL	LF	30	\$ 22.00	\$ 660.00	\$ 20.00	\$ 600.00	\$ 16.00	\$ 480.00	\$ 16.50	\$ 495.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 120.00
02075.13	REMOVAL OF CONCRETE TRICKLE CHANNEL	LF	7	\$ 10.41	\$ 72.87	\$ 15.00	\$ 105.00	\$ 64.00	\$ 448.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 70.00	\$ 6.00	\$ 42.00
02210.01	UNCLASSIFIED EXCAVATION ABOVE SUBGRADE	CY	1,305	\$ 3.60	\$ 4,698.00	\$ 12.25	\$ 15,986.25	\$ 4.00	\$ 5,220.00	\$ 14.00	\$ 18,720.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 13,050.00
02210.03	REJECTED MATERIAL DISPOSAL	CY	100	\$ 10.69	\$ 1,069.00	\$ 22.25	\$ 2,225.00	\$ 11.60	\$ 1,160.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 1,500.00
02210.04	SURPLUS MATERIAL DISPOSAL	CY	1,246	\$ 9.17	\$ 11,425.82	\$ 5.00	\$ 6,230.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 12,460.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 12,460.00	\$ 12.00	\$ 14,952.00
02210.06	IMPORTED BORROW (SAND)	CY	100	\$ 24.19	\$ 2,419.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 900.00	\$ 26.20	\$ 2,620.00	\$ 17.50	\$ 1,750.00	\$ 20.00	\$ 2,000.00
02210.0718	18" PAVED ROAD SUBGRADE PROCESSING	SY	4,760	\$ 9.23	\$ 43,934.80	\$ 7.50	\$ 35,700.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 47,600.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 42,840.00	\$ 5.50	\$ 26,180.00
02210.0818	18" SUBGRADE PROCESSING FOR PATCH	SY	748	\$ 13.67	\$ 10,225.16	\$ 13.00	\$ 9,724.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 11,220.00	\$ 12.50	\$ 9,350.00	\$ 14.00	\$ 10,472.00
02220.01	EXPLORATORY EXCAVATION	HR	10	\$ 360.00	\$ 3,600.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 390.00	\$ 3,900.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 750.00	\$ 7,500.00
02220.02	UNDERGROUND FACILITY LOCATES	EA	5	\$ 146.25	\$ 731.25	\$ 350.00	\$ 1,750.00	\$ 160.00	\$ 800.00	\$ 330.00	\$ 1,650.00	\$ 400.00	\$ 2,000.00
02220.03	UNDERGROUND FACILITY CROSSINGS	EA	5	\$ 202.50	\$ 1,012.50	\$ 500.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 220.00	\$ 1,100.00	\$ 480.00	\$ 2,400.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 2,500.00
02231.0106	6" AGGREGATE BASE	SY	5,508	\$ 4.95	\$ 27,264.60	\$ 10.50	\$ 57,834.00	\$ 5.50	\$ 30,294.00	\$ 8.90	\$ 49,021.20	\$ 16.00	\$ 88,128.00
02511.13	INSTALL TEMPORARY SURFACING	SY	107	\$ 13.11	\$ 1,402.77	\$ 90.00	\$ 9,630.00	\$ 14.25	\$ 1,524.75	\$ 13.00	\$ 1,391.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 1,070.00
02512.0205	5" ASPHALTIC CONCRETE PATCH	SY	301	\$ 54.56	\$ 16,422.56	\$ 57.50	\$ 17,307.50	\$ 60.00	\$ 18,060.00	\$ 55.00	\$ 16,555.00	\$ 70.00	\$ 21,070.00
02520.01065	6.5" PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE PAVING	SY	4,560	\$ 47.69	\$ 217,466.40	\$ 33.50	\$ 152,760.00	\$ 48.00	\$ 218,880.00	\$ 70.00	\$ 319,200.00	\$ 55.00	\$ 250,800.00
02528.013	INSTALL NEW 30" CURB & GUTTER (6.5")	LF	560	\$ 27.69	\$ 15,506.40	\$ 27.00	\$ 15,120.00	\$ 30.00	\$ 16,800.00	\$ 40.00	\$ 22,400.00	\$ 30.00	\$ 16,800.00
02530.0104	INSTALL CONCRETE SIDEWALK (4")	SF	1,355	\$ 4.01	\$ 5,433.55	\$ 6.25	\$ 8,468.75	\$ 6.00	\$ 8,130.00	\$ 8.00	\$ 10,840.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 6,775.00
02530.0408	INSTALL CONCRETE DRIVEWAY (8")	SF	696	\$ 6.07	\$ 4,224.72	\$ 8.00	\$ 5,568.00	\$ 8.00	\$ 5,568.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 6,960.00	\$ 7.00	\$ 4,872.00
02530.0608	INSTALL NEW CONCRETE VALLEY GUTTER (8")	SF	2,400	\$ 6.44	\$ 15,456.00	\$ 7.00	\$ 16,800.00	\$ 8.00	\$ 19,200.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 24,000.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 24,000.00
02530.0808	INSTALL NEW CURB RETURN FILLET (8")	SF	1,131	\$ 8.04	\$ 9,093.24	\$ 11.00	\$ 12,441.00	\$ 8.00	\$ 9,048.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 11,310.00	\$ 14.00	\$ 15,834.00
02530.11	INSTALL SIDEWALK CHASE ASSEMBLY	EA	1	\$ 2,440.00	\$ 2,440.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 2,620.00	\$ 2,620.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 3,000.00
02530.1206	INSTALL HANDICAP RAMP AND LANDING (6")	SF	1,078	\$ 7.85	\$ 8,462.30	\$ 8.50	\$ 9,163.00	\$ 12.00	\$ 12,936.00	\$ 16.50	\$ 17,787.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 16,170.00
02725.36	INSTALL CONCRETE TRICKLE CHANNEL	LF	35	\$ 45.00	\$ 1,575.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 1,750.00	\$ 110.00	\$ 3,850.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 1,750.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 3,500.00
02805.01	INSTALL SIGN	EA	2	\$ 99.00	\$ 198.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 600.00	\$ 400.00	\$ 800.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 500.00
02805.02	REMOVAL OF SIGN	EA	2	\$ 75.00	\$ 150.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 125.00	\$ 250.00
02895.02	INSTALL GEOGRID	SY	100	\$ 5.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 3.50	\$ 350.00	\$ 45.00	\$ 4,500.00	\$ 7.33	\$ 733.00
02900.15	INSTALL BLOCK RETAINING WALL	SF	30	\$ 32.00	\$ 960.00	\$ 65.00	\$ 1,950.00	\$ 108.00	\$ 3,240.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 1,050.00	\$ 7.00	\$ 210.00
02900.16	INSTALL FENCE (CHAINLINK BRACE PANEL)	LF	10	\$ 30.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 57.50	\$ 575.00	\$ 53.00	\$ 530.00	\$ 30.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 500.00
SP-02512.02	ADDITIONAL ASPHALTIC CONCRETE PATCH DEPTH (1")	SY	45	\$ 13.64	\$ 613.80	\$ 57.50	\$ 2,587.50	\$ 16.00	\$ 720.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 4,500.00	\$ 12.00	\$ 540.00
SP-02900.23	LANDSCAPING ROCK	SY	25	\$ 6.00	\$ 150.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 875.00	\$ 24.00	\$ 600.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 1,250.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 125.00
SP-05220.01	INSTALL HANDRAIL	LF	50	\$ 57.72	\$ 2,886.00	\$ 75.00	\$ 3,750.00	\$ 76.00	\$ 3,800.00	\$ 30.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 310.00	\$ 15,500.00
TOTAL BID					\$ 579,117.34		\$ 620,281.75		\$ 620,913.00		\$ 863,903.40		\$ 744,173.55

The Tabulation of Bids herein is believed to be a true representation of the Bids received on February 7, 2018. Any discrepancies in the indicated sum of any column of figures, as presented in the bids, and the correct sum thereof, have been resolved per Section 00200 INSTRUCTIONS TO BIDDERS and are so reflected in this tabulation.

Zane Green, P.E.
Morrison-Maierle, Inc.

