



office@sdwyo.com  
(307) 682-2605  
316 S. Gillette Ave.  
P.O. Box 2767  
Gillette, WY 82717

March 23, 2018  
Project No. 18007

City of Gillette  
Engineering Division  
201 E. 5<sup>th</sup> St.  
Gillette, Wyoming 82716

ATTN: Todd Merchen

**RE: Gurley Avenue Overpass  
Deck Rehabilitation  
City of Gillette Project No. 18EN15**

Dear Mr. Merchen:

Bids were received at 3:00 P.M. on March 20, 2018 for the above referenced Project, with two (2) general contractors submitting bids. Proper bid security in the form of a bid bond in the amount of five percent (5%) of the amount bid was included with each of the Bids. Both bid bonds were on the City of Gillette's standard form. A "Certificate of Residency Status" was also submitted with each of the two (2) Bids. Both bids acknowledged Addendums 1 and 2.

The following is a listing of the Bids received, the commentary on their review, and our recommendations:

A. Bids Received:

<b>Bidder</b>	<b>Base Bid</b>
<i>Engineer's Estimate</i>	<i>\$798,358.84</i>
S&S Builders, LLC	\$913,121.20
Powder River Construction, Inc.	\$915,528.25

The base bid includes rehabilitation of the bridge deck at the Gurley Avenue Overpass and rehabilitation of pavement sections at the intersection of Gurley Avenue & East Fourth Street.

B. Numerical Errors on Bid Forms:

The Bids submitted had no apparent errors.

C. Apparent Low Bid:

S&S Builders, LLC is the apparent low bidder for the Base Bid. We contacted Jason Tystad of S&S Builders, LLC after the bid and he stated the following:

1. He said that they are comfortable with their Bid.
2. He did not list any subcontractors on the Bid Form. They will self-perform all items.
3. He said that their goal is to start work in late-May to early-June, after the seasonal limitations for the bridge work begin.

D. Bid Analysis:

1. Structural Dynamics, LLC provided an estimate for the work contained on the schedule. In comparing the Bids and the Engineer's Estimate for work on this schedule, the following was noted:
  - a. S&S Builders' Base Bid was \$114,762.36 higher than (or 14.4% of) the Engineer's Estimate of \$798,358.84.
  - b. The average of the two Base Bids received was \$914,324.73. The range between the high and low Base Bids was \$2,407.05, or approximately 0.26% of the bid average. S&S Builders' Base Bid was \$913,121.20, or approximately 0.13% less than the bid average. These values indicate a very low disparity in bid amounts, which indicates a competitive bid and a clear understanding of the scope of the work by both bidders.
2. The following is a review of some of the factors contributing to the difference between the Engineer's Estimate of costs and the low bid received:
  - a. Unit pricing for the associated bridge work was obtained using comparable WYDOT pricing of similar projects. Unit pricing for the associated pavement work was obtained using comparable City of Gillette pricing of similar projects. The differences in actual pricing vs. engineer's estimates do not necessarily indicate bid irregularity.
  - b. Work involving Silica Fume Modified Concrete, particularly the addition of the more-stringent SRA specifications, is not common in this area, which results in a lack of recent and relevant comparable pricing for use in cost estimating.

E. Recommendation:

Despite S&S Builders' low bid exceeding the project cost estimate, it is our opinion that their bid was fair and competitive, and that the disparity was due to the lack of recent comparable cost data for placement of Silica Fume Modified Concrete.

Due to the lack of qualified contractors for this type of work in this area, as indicated by the low number of bids on this project, it is our opinion that it would not be in the City's best interest to re-bid the project. Further, any significant delay in awarding the work as a result of re-bidding could result in additional deterioration of the bridge deck, resulting in additional repair costs. A delay in awarding the work could also make completion of the project during the 2018 construction season much more difficult.

S&S Builders, LLC is familiar with this type of work and have performed many bridge and pavement projects similar to this project. They also performed the Gurley Avenue Viaduct Rehabilitation project (City of Gillette Project No. 07EN43) completed in 2010, which included very similar bridge deck rehabilitation. It is our opinion that S&S Builders, LLC is qualified for the work.

Based on the completeness of the bid and value for the Owner, we recommend that a contract be awarded to the low bidder, S&S Builders, LLC, for the Base Bid amount of \$913,121.20.

If you have any questions concerning this Project, please contact us.

Structural Dynamics, LLC



Philip P. Hohn, P.E.  
Senior Engineer