

January 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2019

Josh Richardson Engineering 201 E. 5<sup>th</sup> St. Gillette, WY 82716

## RE: City Pool Parking Lot Improvements, 19EN05

Dear Josh,

The purpose of this letter is to provide the Engineer's Recommendation of Award to the City of Gillette for the City Pool Parking Lot Improvements project. A bid opening for this project was conducted on Tuesday January 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2018 at COG's Purchasing office. The following is a brief summary of the post-bid activities.

**Review of Bids.** Below is a list of the received bids for this project.

## 1. Powder River Construction \$648,768.00 (low bid)

- 2. Hot Iron \$716,414.61
- 3. LJS Concrete & Excavating \$728,637.00
- 4. Van Ewing \$740,143.22
- 5. Mountain Peak Builders \$763,280.60

We have tabulated all bids and formatted them in an Excel spreadsheet – attached – for price verification and comparison purposes. The individual bid prices included in Powder River Construction's bid seem to be reasonable and in line with the remaining bidders and Engineer's estimate with the exception of the following items.

Bid Item No	Item Name	Unit	<b>Bid Quantity</b>	Unit Price	<b>Extended Price</b>
02210.02	Excavation Below Subgrade (As Needed)	CY	400	\$48.50	\$19 <i>,</i> 400.00
02210.03	Rejected Material Disposal (As Needed)	CY	400	\$0.01	\$4.00
02210.06	Imported Material Borrow (Sand)	CY	400	\$0.01	\$4.00
02530.11	Install Sidewalk Chase Assembly	EA	4	\$7,000.00	\$28,000.00

In talking with Powder River Construction, this is how they prefer to weight their bid and the prices provided for the items above do not raise any major concerns. It may be beneficial to inquire about the Sidewalk Chase Assemblies and discuss options to stay within the anticipated budget for this item. PRC's bid did not contain any numerical errors.

Some numerical errors were found in the remaining bids. Within the electronic bid form provided to the contractors, the formatting for the cell containing the total construction cost did not include the proper number of significant figures resulting in the totals being rounded to the nearest dollar. This error did not affect PRC's bid given that the extended prices of their bid items summed to a whole dollar.

The bid received from LJS Concrete & Excavating contained additional errors and anomalies as follows:

- On the front page of the bid form Addendum #1 was acknowledged but the revised electronic bid schedule was not included resulting in incorrect bid quantities.
- The unit price and extended price for Bid Item No 01020.03 Force Account was changed from \$10,000.00 to \$24,000.00 dollars.
- The extended cost for the bid item no. 02570.05 Adjust Water Valve Box was left blank.
- The electronic bid form was either altered or not used based on the differences in formatting, footers, and the lack of the disclaimer on the final page.
- The first three pages of the bid schedule was printed and the last page was handwritten.
- The seals included on the bid bond are either stamped with ink or copied with no evidence of a raised seal.

Due to the above, LJS Concrete & Excavating's bid would probably need to be rejected per section 00200, 19.03.

Powder River Construction's bid package included a completed and signed Bid Form, authority to sign, acknowledgment of Addendum #1 dated January 18<sup>th</sup>, 2019, an up-to-date State of Wyoming Certificate of Residency Status, a Bid Security in the form of a signed, 5% Bid Bond, and listed the following subcontractors.

- Delta Wye Electrical
- DRM Pipe
- Scenic Landscaping Landscaping

In summary, DOWL has performed our post-bid evaluation and it appears that we have a low responsible bidder. In talking with Lance Walker at Powder River Construction, they are comfortable with their submitted bid. If adequate funds are in place for this project, DOWL recommends that the award goes to Powder River Construction.

Please call if you wish to discuss any aspects of this project, the bids, or the contractor. We look forward to continuing to work on this project with the City of Gillette and will strive to see that this is a successful project.

Sincerely,

Bernie Straetker, E.I. Project Engineer

Attachment(s): Bid Tabs