

February 15, 2019

Bob Molder
City of Gillette Wastewater Treatment Facility
3101 S Garner Lake Road
Gillette, WY 82718

RE: Wastewater Treatment Plant Digester Tank Coating Project
MMI Project Number 4323.043

Mr. Molder:

Morrison-Maierle has reviewed the two bids received at 1:00 p.m. on February 13, 2019 for the Wastewater Treatment Plant Digester Tank Coating Project. Of the bids received, both are recommended for acceptance as responsive bids.

The following Contractors submitted bids, listed alphabetically:

- JR Civil, LLC. Sheridan, WY
- RCS Construction, Inc. Rapid City, SD

All bids received appeared to meet all requirements. All forms were signed, sealed, used City of Gillette forms, and had bid bonds for the corrected amounts. There were no mathematical errors in either bid.

The following table summarizes the bids received, as well as the Engineer's Estimate.

Bidder	Base Bid (Secondary Digester)	Additive Alternate (Primary Digester)	Total Bid (Base Bid + Add. Alt. 1)
RCS Construction	\$ 265,583.14	\$ 209,955.10	\$ 475,538.24
JR Civil, LLC	\$ 280,082.00	\$ 231,429.00	\$ 511,511.00
Engineer's Estimate	\$ 187,900.00	\$ 162,000.00	\$ 349,900.00

JR Civil provided a Wyoming Preference certificate. RCS Construction did not. In accordance with the 5% Wyoming Preference Act of 1971, W.S. 16-6-201, 5% of the lowest bid is added to the non-resident low bid and compared to the Wyoming bidder. Regardless if only the base bid is used or the sum of the base bid plus the additive alternate, RCS Construction is lower than JR Civil taking into account the 5% preference. This does not change the lowest bidder.

The low base bid received was \$77,683.14 higher than the Engineer's Estimate. There is only \$14,498.86 (5.46%) difference between the highest and the lowest bids. The low base bid plus additive alternate received was \$125,683.14 higher than the Engineer's Estimate with only \$35,972.76 (7.56%) difference between the highest and the lowest bids.

We create solutions that build better communities.

This particular job has two very specialized components that limit the number of qualified contractors that can do the work. The job required a Specialty Digester Cleaner and a Certified Coating Contractor that had done work on other wastewater treatment plants. During the design phase, twelve cleaning contractors were called to get conservative bids for cleaning the digesters. The twelve contacted were the only 12 contractors that could be located between Illinois and California that had substantial history doing this type of work. Of the twelve, only five were even generally interested in the project and quotes ranged from \$40,000 to \$140,000 with only one bid under \$100,000. The low estimated quote of \$40,000 later stated he was not interested in the work as he was tied up in other locations.

Additionally, the same can be said about the painters. The cost of painting came in higher as well. The contract has a very tight timeline which may require heating. It also is in a confined space with access being through ~30" penetrations. All scaffolding must be lowered in, set up, and done through 2 ports.

Speaking to the Prime Contractors, they both received multiple bids by cleaners and painters and both selected the same subcontractors for their quote. The cleaner selected is the closest one to Gillette and that work came in under \$100,000. The painter is located in South Dakota and has done previous work successfully on the Gillette Wastewater Treatment Plant. With the tight timelines and nature of this project, the team proposed is as qualified to do the work.

The prices of both of these components are what is higher than the Engineer's Estimate. However, given this dynamic of bids received and who quoted the job, it likely will not get any cheaper doing a rebid. With the range between the bidders, it is our opinion that the bids received were competitive.

Based on this bid, we recommend awarding the contract for the Wastewater Treatment Plant Digester Tank Coating Project to RCS Construction, in the amount of \$265,583.14 for the base bid or \$475,538.24 for both the base bid and additive alternate, contingent upon City of Gillette funds.

We have also attached the official bid tabulation. Please review and let us know if you have any questions.

Sincerely,
MORRISON-MAIERLE, INC.



Zane A. Green, P.E.
Project Engineer
Encl (1): Bid Tabulation